

# CLIMATE CHANGE COMMISSION

## CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU

925 DILLINGHAM BOULEVARD, SUITE 257 • HONOLULU, HAWAII 96817  
PHONE: (808) 768-2277 • EMAIL: ccc@honolulu.gov • INTERNET: www.resilientoahu.org



KIRK CALDWELL  
MAYOR

MAKENA COFFMAN, PH.D., CHAIR  
CHARLES FLETCHER, PH.D., VICE CHAIR  
ROSIE ALEGADO, PH.D.  
VICTORIA KEENER, PH.D.  
BETTINA MEHNERT, FAIA, LEED AP

### Climate Change Commission Monday, October 26, 2020 9:30AM Zoom Virtual Meeting Meeting Minutes

**Members Present:** Makena Coffman, Victoria Keener, and Bettina Mehnert.

**Members Absent:** Rosie Alegado and Charles Fletcher.

**Public:** Uyen Vong, Josh Stanbro, Matt Gonser, Hayley Cook, Sophie Lee, Reyna Cohen, and Lala Nuss (Office of Climate Change, Sustainability and Resiliency); Courtney Sue-Ako (Corporation Counsel), Layla Kilolu, Rachael Han, Barry Usagawa (Board of Water Supply), Laura Mo, Henry Curtis, Bob Nishimoto, Dave Martin, Colby Stanton, Rafael Lee, Elaine Aye, Ryan Kobayashi, Melanie Lander, Josh Taitano, Katherine Hernandez, Tracy Tonaki, William Tam, Christin Reynolds, Lauren Watanabe (Sierra Club, Oahu Group), D Nakano, Audrey Lee, Nancy McPherson, Stephanie Sakamoto, Aida Arik, Bruce Tsuchida, Dane Sjoblom, Jeanne Ishikawa (Department of Parks and Recreation), Ben Sullivan (County of Kauai), Leilikolehua Gill, and Kiana Otsuka (Oahu Metropolitan Planning Organization).

**Call to Order:** Chair Keener called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m.

**Roll Call:** Three Commissioners were present. Quorum was established.

**Approval of the Meeting Minutes of September 21, 2020:** The September 21, 2020 meeting minutes were adopted as is. (**AYE:** All; **NAY:** None; **ABSTAIN:** None)

**Report on the Activities of the Office of Climate Change, Sustainability and Resiliency (CCSR):** Executive Director Josh Stanbro presented the following:

- The CCSR office is actively working on assisting with the City's COVID-19 response and CARES Act funding implementation. The office has been the main driver for the CARES Act dashboard on the One O'ahu website, to ensure funding is being reported to the public in an open and transparent way, and is also continuing to work on COVID-19 testing efforts.
- The CCSR office has recently launched Climate Ready O'ahu, an effort to create a climate adaptation strategy to address climate change impacts on the island. Community outreach began last week to obtain feedback on community concerns regarding vulnerabilities and risks for the island. The expected timeline for this project is about a year, with ICF as the contractor assisting CCSR.
- Climate Ready O'ahu has a website, where community member can take surveys and listen in on community sessions. [www.climatereadyoahu.org](http://www.climatereadyoahu.org)
- Through this effort, a community advisory hui, with members representing a wide variety of sectors, was formed to help inform the City's climate adaptation approach.
- Bill 65 would codify and clarify the role of the CCSR office, which was set up in 2016. Over the past three years, the office has been able to work with different departments in the City, establish partnerships externally, and build programs. Now the office has a better sense of what works in bringing in funding and being effective in its role. This bill would articulate the role of this office and lay out the expectations. If commitments

are made by the administration, City Council, or state law, CCSR can assist with monitoring the benchmarks and milestones to reach those goals.

- Bill 65 (2020), as was initially submitted, had more detail. The CD1 that was passed out of committee is more pared down on appealing to what the programmatic responsibilities of what the office are. While the office supports the intent of CD1, the office also supports the higher level of details. The office expects the bill to be on the agenda on November 5 where the full council is going to review CD1.

**Questions and Comments that followed:**

1. Chair Keener inquired about the changes in Bill 65, and the justification in removing those metrics and level of detail. Stanbro responded that there were some concerns that were brought up in the community from different stakeholders weighing in on appropriateness of having the office having metrics that were outside of the operations of the City. He told the committee that a climate action plan that addresses the 3-4% emissions generated from City operations is not a climate action plan. A climate action plan, which is understood by other cities, should be for all emissions across the entire jurisdiction. The discussion then moved towards reviewing the role of the CCSR office under the charter and creating more simplified language at this point.
2. Commissioner Coffman inquired about the One Water planning framework in Bill 65, which the Commission supported. Commissioner Coffman acknowledged that the current language of the bill as it relates to One Water seems to be more generalized, whereas the original language was more specific, and inquired what the process would be if the current language moved forward. Stanbro responded that the reason for the change in language was because the Committee inquired how much collaboration between departments were to be written in, and if CCSR might be doing the work of another department or agency. BWS initiated the One Water framework, and testified at the Committee meeting that they support this non-siloed, multiple department approach convened by CCSR. The CCSR office will continue to work with all the departments to ensure that Council understands that it was created this way. The other issue was placement of One Water in the ordinance. In the original version, One Water was in Section 30, while CCSR office was in Section 2. This issue points out the difficulty that older systems have wrestling with newer problems that are multi-sectoral like climate change. When working with water, it is not just a freshwater issue, it is a stormwater problem and wastewater issue, which are in different sections of the ordinance. By the very nature of climate change, multiple issues have to be addressed at once. It does not fit neatly into the systems that have been developed before.
3. Chair Keener stated that the deleted language concerning the requirement that CCSR should work in coordination with other departments and agencies, particularly with the One Water framework, is necessary to the success of the entire strategy. Keener acknowledged that the integration across departments is crucial to the success of the framework.

**Communication and Correspondence from the Public:** Chair Keener received correspondence from Tawn Keeney regarding impacted air transport and impact on the carbon footprint for the State of Hawai'i

**Discussion on Climate Change Commission's Participation in the Climate Ready O'ahu Community Advisory Hui**

- Matt Gonser reported that the office began its first series of its virtual engagements last week, starting with the advisory hui. The hui requested participation from the Commissioners. The hui utilized a fair amount of existing information, such as known problem climate impacts are already being seen and social vulnerability information.
- The office wanted the hui to represent a broad cross section across industry and business,

community and education, culture and environment. In addition, the office wanted to ensure that they were capitalizing on current activities, such as the North Shore Sustainable Communities Plan, which will be starting its update next year.

- The office sent out 55 invitations to join the hui, and 41 people confirmed. There is an advisory hui page on the Climate Ready Oahu website, the roster will be posted this week, and the agenda and recording of the first meeting will be posted.
- Chair Keener inquired if the hui is looking for just one representative from the Commission. Gonser confirmed.
- Chair Keener acknowledged that Commissioner Fletcher expressed interest in being the representative for the Commission, and that she supported him continuing to be the representative. Commissioner Coffman and Commissioner Mehnert both supported Commissioner Fletcher as the Commission's representative.
- Commissioner Coffman inquired if the hui representative had to be the same person at each meeting, or if it could be any representative from the Commission. Gonser responded that the hui would like the same representative for the sake of consistency, but the meetings are all open to the public.
- Chair Keener inquired if the participants would be broken out into separate groups based on their sector. Gonser responded that the session formats are plenary to gather community feedback and concerns.
- Chair Keener inquired with Uyen Vong if other Commissioners could attend as members of the public. Vong replied that only two Commissioners can attend the meeting. While sunshine law is currently suspended, Vong advises that the Commission continues to abide by it.
- The next meeting is Monday, November 9, 2020 from 3:30PM-5:30PM. Five advisory hui meetings will be scheduled between January and June 2021.
- For more information on the advisory hui, visit: <https://www.climatereadyoahu.org/advisory-hui>. To be added to the adaptation plans email distribution list, email [climateready@honolulu.gov](mailto:climateready@honolulu.gov)

#### **Discussion on Status of Updated Climate Change Brief**

- Chair Keener acknowledged that the climate brief was originally released by the Commission in 2018 and is now being updated for new statistics and impacts as new science and data has been released.
- Commissioner Coffman presented updated sections, an additional section on wildfires, a more expansive section on energy, greenhouse gases, and food systems, and a section in the end titled, "Areas for Further Research" to address the gap where global trends might be understood, but where there are gaps in local trends.

#### **Questions and Comments that followed:**

1. Chair Keener requested to include human health section and disproportionately impacted communities, and to add more detail on human health impacts like heat stress and impacts actually observed in the state of Hawai'i. For example, the impact of heat stress on children at school and energy usage, and impacts relating to more intense hurricanes and storms and winds and potential impacts on more vulnerable communities without shelters that are up to code for hurricane strength winds.
2. Chair Keener also requested to include infrastructure, such as places that are being impacted by sea level rise and infrastructure being removed and not rebuilt.
3. Chair Keener inquired if the order of variables should be changed to cyclone, storms, precipitation, wind, streamflow, oceans, then wildfires.
4. Chair Keener requested that in the "Areas for further research" that more information on agricultural production in Hawai'i, such as the nature of growing food in Hawai'i and agricultural system futures, acknowledging there is a lack of research on this topic.
5. Commissioner Mehnert inquired where impacts on infrastructure should be highlighted. For example, water, sewer, buildings, and key facilities such as hospitals,

and how prepared these places are, or might not be. She acknowledged that climate change impacts may be more severe for an island community. While it has a place on the global side, the local impacts are more important for our context.

6. Commissioner Coffman proposed a new section for infrastructure impacts, which would also include electricity.
7. Chair Keener proposed that Commissioner Alegado might be able to provide specific comments and inputs within her expertise area. Vong confirmed that Alegado can submit comments on this draft.
8. A public comment on Facebook Live inquired if the brief covers the impact of climate change on the tourism industry, such as the decline of beaches, habitat changes, etc. Chair Keener acknowledged that the brief does not have that kind of information, nor on the economic impacts. Commissioner Coffman acknowledged that while there have been studies done on specific aspects as they relate to economic impacts, there are no comprehensive citations to use. Some elements can be brought in, such as the lost value of a hurricane going through Waikiki. However, broader economic aspects could go into the "Areas for further research" section. Chair Keener acknowledged that in the most recent National Climate Assessment chapter, there are dollar figures of ecosystem services that coral reefs provide at the state level. Adding those citations might be helpful. In addition, adding the impact of climate change on the tourism industry could also be included in the "Areas for further research" section.
9. Henry Curtis requested that "Trees and Forest Inventories" be included in the "Areas for further research" section. In addition, in the section for Hawai'i and Local Impacts in Energy and GHG, he requested that the language be clarified to, "as quickly as practicable but no later than 2045" HRS 225P5. In addition, Curtis requests to add language: "Emissions in this analysis are based on where emissions are produced, not where they are consumed. By contrast, the Hawai'i PUC is examining lifecycle emissions."
10. Chair Keener inquired if Commissioner Coffman has a timeline for completing the update. Coffman inquired if Gonser had a particular timeline that was useful so that this could be a resource for the climate adaptation plan. Gonser responded that the team is already using the 2018 version of the brief. The team took the thirteen main categories to filter down through an engagement process, choosing the top five to further investigate. They will try to immediately incorporate that is readily available. Commissioner Coffman proposed to finalize by the end of the year but depending on other needs of the Commission.

**Update on Equity Focus Group for Input into Social Equity Guidance Document by Lala Nuss, Climate Resilience and Equity Program Manager:** Lala Nuss presented the following:

- Nuss hosted a focus group last Thursday with six community members representing frontline community organizations on O'ahu, a two-hour session to discuss key questions that were relevant to the social equity guidance document. For those who were not able to attend, she is also sending a Google questionnaire to solicit their insight. Currently having research team analyze qualitative data and will be incorporating that information into the final document.
- Chair Keener acknowledged that she enjoyed being part of that very insightful discussion and grateful that everyone took time to share their thoughts. Top-level community concerns that emerged from the discussion included: Climate change impacts of concern include freshwater supply and access, food security, sea level rise impact on transportation, economic job opportunities, the potential for climate change to exacerbate inequalities, wildfire control.
- Chair Keener acknowledged that the group thought that the impacts in their communities were being listened to by the City but were not being well-addressed, and that they understand that it is part of a longer process. Learning how to make those timelines clearer and knowing where to go with different concerns in the City could be an important action.
- They stressed that some groups such as the youth are often excluded from the decision-making process and the importance of youth participation.

- They also stressed there were a lot of people from different nonprofits across island and state, and they work very well together for common goals but are often forced to compete for scarce financial recovery and adaptation resources which can make it difficult to get things done in an integrated way.
- They stressed the importance of building civic duty and community as a strong recovery resource.
- Conservation funding from the State is relatively small, compared to the problems that need to be addressed.
- The City and CCSR can help increase climate equity through setting common goals, using a common language and facilitating cooperation between different agencies and NGOs and groups
- Recognition that community plans and the passion in those communities are often one of the most important resources that they can bring to get these processes into policy and management

#### **Discussion and Action on Testimony regarding Bill 65**

- Chair Keener acknowledged that while Bill 65 is not yet in final form, to have a discussion about the changes that were mentioned by Stanbro earlier in the meeting, and the option of the Commission submitting testimony.
- Commissioner Coffman acknowledged that the One Water framework would be most appropriate to support in the bill since the Commission already submitted testimony in support of it. She acknowledged that the new language in the bill states something to the effect of planning a One Water framework, when BWS and Christin Reynolds at One World One Water had already laid out a strong foundation to execute the One Water framework.
- Chair Keener agreed that supporting the One Water framework was the most appropriate, the implementation of One Water and the integration across different departments at the City-scale, that was the strength that the framework brought, and BWS did a great job of laying that out and getting buy-in.
- Chair Keener inquired with Director Stanbro on how to make it known to the Council to strengthen the language to support the One Water framework. Stanbro responded that it is the Commission's decision on how to articulate the Commission's perspective.
- Commissioner Mehnert acknowledged that she supports the One Water framework.
- Commissioner Coffman acknowledged that the Commission's testimony should reflect that while the Commission is not weighing in on the entire bill, that the Commission is supporting the One Water framework as it has already weighed in on this matter in the past.

#### **Comments and Public Testimony that Followed:**

1. Christin Reynolds will share some of the previous testimony and history to Uyen, who will then distribute to the Commissioners
2. Audrey Lee inquired via Zoom chat on whether CCSR office is in favor or in opposition to collaborating with other departments. Stanbro responded that this is the role of his office. The office does not do regulation or implementation, CCSR serves as technical expertise and policy development. CCSR works with different City departments that have a major stake in climate adaptation and mitigation. The One Water framework is a good example of how departments would have clear direction on how they work together so that there is less confusion on who is lead on certain elements.

**Commissioner Coffman moved and Commissioner Mehnert seconded the motion to submit testimony in favor of Bill 65 (2020), specifically to include the main points of the One Water section of Bill 65 (2020) (AYE: Coffman, Keener, Mehnert; NAY: None; ABSTAIN: None.)**

**Tentative Next Meeting Date:** The next meeting date is November 16, 2020 at 9:30AM via Zoom.

**Announcements:** There were no announcements.

**Adjournment:** The meeting was adjourned at 10:45 AM.