



Climate Change Commission

CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU

925 Dillingham Boulevard, Suite 257 • Honolulu, Hawai'i 96817

COMMISSIONERS

Makena Coffman, Ph.D., Chair
Charles Fletcher, Ph.D., Vice Chair
Rosanna Alegado, Ph.D.
Victoria Keener, Ph.D.
Bettina Mehnert, FAIA, LEED AP

Climate Change Commission Wednesday, June 10, 2020 3:30PM Zoom Virtual Meeting Meeting Minutes

Members Present: Rosanna Alegado, Makena Coffman, Charles Fletcher, Victoria Keener, Bettina Mehnert.

Members Absent: None.

Public: (CCSR office: Josh Stanbro; Justin Gruenstein; Uyen Vong; Laurien Nuss; Matt Gonser; Rocky Mould; Hayley Cook; Michael Nguyen, Taylor Ursulum); Courtney Sue-Ako (City Corporation Counsel); Alex Beatly (DPP); Tim Houghton (DES); Barry Usugawa (DWP); Christin Reynolds (One World One Water LLC); Kathleen Rooney (Ulupono); Henry Curtis (Life of the Land); David Arakawa (Land Use Research Foundation); Aida Arik (University of Hawaii); Brad Romine (Sea Grant); Layla Kilolu (University of Hawaii); Nate Hix; Leighton Chong; Kristin Punu; and Angela Tseng.

Call to Order: Chair Makena Coffman called the meeting to order at 3:35 p.m.

Roll Call: Five Commissioners were present. Quorum was established.

Approval of the Meeting Minutes, as amended, of January 22, 2020: (AYE: Alegado, Coffman, Fletcher, Keener, Mehnert; NAY: None; ABSTAIN: None.)

Report on the Activities of the Office of Climate Change, Sustainability and Resiliency (CCSR): Chair Coffman motioned to return to this item when Executive Director Stanbro is present.

Update from the Community Kūkākūkā Project and Data Request: Climate Resilience and Equity Manager, Laurien (Lala) Nuss from CCSR presented the following report:

- Lala and the Equity team have been active in virtual community outreach to frontline communities. She is collecting both qualitative and quantitative data on how communities are responding to the COVID-19 crisis and on overall community resilience. She hopes that this information might be useful for the Commission's equity paper and the City's Climate Action Plan.

Questions and Comments that followed:

1. Keener asked how many interviews have been completed. Nuss replied that her team has completed thirty interviews and will be releasing a preliminary report in mid-July, along with a virtual report and debrief with community leaders who were involved.
2. Fletcher asked what was discussed in these meetings and how many people attended. Nuss replied that the current format has been adapted from its original framework. Prior to the stay at home order, her team was scheduled to conduct two intentional community engagement programs: the climate open house, and then a deeper dive in community spaces to talk story about climate change and the communities' abilities. Since COVID-19, they had to cancel the open houses, so they adopted the Community Kūkākūkā to be resilience-focused. Using their database of community frontline organizations, they conducted hour-long interviews. The first

part is relationship-building and authentic storytelling frameworks to receive qualitative and quantitative data, and asking a series of questions, based on responses regarding community needs, concerns, and abilities. The second part is looking at resiliency, and the third part is looking at the relationship between communities and City. Specifically, they are looking at access and agency to better participate in decision making with CCSR and the City. The focus here is community-source knowledge and experiential story-telling to get a pulse on what communities are experiencing. Some connections were seen between climate change and COVID-19 with regard to resilience. Nuss' team will be coding the information and pulling overall themes, to integrate equity in all their climate change work.

3. Nancy McPherson from the State Department of Hawaiian Homelands (DHHL) commented that she appreciates Nuss' efforts to reach out to her department.

Communication and Correspondence from the Public: The Commission did not receive any testimony prior to this meeting.

One Water Presentation (Christin Reynolds, One World One Water, LLC) - Reynolds led a PowerPoint presentation titled, "One Water for Climate Resiliency":

- The One Water framework is a response to climate change impacts, sea level rise, rainfall pattern changes, hazards and natural disasters, and development pressures that City agencies have to respond to. The framework involves collaborative planning, budgeting, and implementation.
- San Francisco is a city that has implemented the One Water framework and through it developed 272 green infrastructure projects and increased water use efficiency.
- While the City does a good job of providing services such as clean water and disposing of wastewater, there is no formal coordination among departments to undertake interagency projects such as "lifting streets." To coordinate projects, engineers and government leaders need to work together.
- "Out of the gate" projects include Mapunapuna sea level rise adaptation, Complete Streets, Ala Wai storm water management plan, Ewa water reuse, and cesspool conversion.
- Honolulu is in a unique position because the City has full control of the watersheds.

Questions and Comments that followed:

1. Chair Coffman thanked Reynolds and acknowledged that last year a group went to various US cities to learn about how sea level rise issues were being addressed in those cities. In some cities, the streets were raised, but the underground pipes were not raised because collaborative frameworks were not in place.
2. Keener asked if Usagawa could provide a summary of how he envisions One Water assisting the Board of Water Supply (BWS) in their planning. Usagawa responded that in BWS water conservation initiatives, the One Water framework would create a formalized way to work with other city agencies. As sea levels rise, it may take longer to repair main breaks, which could lead to longer disruption periods. To lift streets, BWS needs to collaborate with other agencies, and institutionalizing these collaborations will be helpful.
3. Alegado commented that the proposed framework appears urban-focused and asked how One Water preserves appurtenant rights for farmers. Alegado also asked why in Action 5 of presentation that the coordination is only with private development, and why there seems to be a lack of community input in these actions. Reynolds responded that she can write in those concerns because water security affects everyone. The point was to get the City to work together with the other City departments, to start small and then naturally build momentum.
4. Usagawa mentioned that there are a number of other projects not mentioned in the One Water paper. For example, there is a collaborative effort between the Department of Parks and Recreation with BWS that involves creating a learning center in the back of Ko'olaupoko Valley, to restore the lo'i. Usagawa commented that the One Water framework uses the ahupua'a model and is an environmentally holistic plan.
5. Alegado highly encouraged Reynolds to include a rural demonstration project to reflect that they are not focusing on just the urban core.
6. Mehnert inquired where the One Water framework has been implemented, and what aspects of the framework has worked in those other places that may not work on O'ahu, and vice-versa. Reynolds replied that CDM Smith conducted an assessment of One Water programs and what she learned is the scale of the program depends how involved those cities were. For example, San Francisco was more focused on making those collaboration points, which

influenced the proposed One Water framework to be focused on action.

7. Chair Coffman asked how Reynolds and Usagawa see the One Water framework relating to the proposed stormwater utility. Usagawa responded that there are various reuse opportunities both outdoors and indoors to reduce the runoff and reduce potable use onsite. Usagawa commented that this is good example on how BWS can leverage mutual benefits into a structured program.
8. Fletcher asked what the future is of the One Water white paper. Reynolds responded that she envisioned the white paper being owned by the Commission, and that she would be happy to take in edits. Fletcher also asked how they see these efforts being resourced in the future, in terms of staff and outreach. Usagawa responded that he would like to coordinate with CCSR on outreach and that while BWS has funding going through this year and next year, Usagawa is hoping that the MOUs can share some of the funding across agencies. Usagawa envisioned starting off with small quarterly or monthly meetings.

Comments and Public Testimony that Followed: There were no comments or public testimony.

Discussion and Action on Submittal of Memorandum in Support of One Water Framework

Commissioners reviewed and suggested edits to the draft memorandum. Commissioner Mehnert moved to approve and Alegado seconded the memorandum as edited. (**AYE:** Alegado, Coffman, Fletcher, Keener, Mehnert; **NAY:** None; **ABSTAIN:** None.)

Report on the Activities of the Office of Climate Change, Sustainability and Resiliency (CCSR):

Executive Director and Chief Resilience Officer Josh Stanbro presented the following:

- Stanbro thanked Usagawa for his leadership coming in looking for a collaborative and proactive ways to address challenges with other City departments.
- In response to the COVID-19 crisis, the CCSR staff was detailed to the City's call center, assisting in various capacities.
- CCSR staff members are helping with community outreach to educate the public regarding the emergency proclamations. Staff have fielded over 12,000 phone calls and 5,000 emails. The oneoahu.org website has had 470,000 page views. 22% of island people have gone on the website on get clarity on the Mayor's Emergency Orders. A dashboard is in development for the public that shows all the public information on COVID-19 and the City's response to the crisis.
- The CCSR office has also been assisting with testing efforts to ensure that 100,000 COVID-19 tests can be accessed by the public. The CCSR office is also working with the Department of Environmental Services on testing COVID-19 in wastewater.
- The CCSR office is facilitating the strengthening and expanding the City's economic recovery efforts to respond to the COVID-19 economic downturn with an establishment of an Office of Economic Revitalization to address long-term economic challenges.
- The Commission is encouraged to pursue work in economic recovery and sustainable agriculture, which is connected to climate security.
- The CCSR office is also working on the City's Climate Action Plan (Resolution 18-221), despite the climate open houses being cancelled due to COVID-19. The office is doing more one-to-one conversations with frontline communities on what should be included into the plan.
- There is a virtual engagement open house that the public can participate in to provide their input. Information about the virtual engagement open house has been sent out to various networks, is available on the CCSR website, and is open until June 22, 2020.
- There is a new tool that is tracking Mayor Caldwell's 100,000 tree initiative. The tool shows that O'ahu has added a total of 29,000 trees planted around the island.
- There is a new Climate Ready map viewer where various layers, such as heat and sea level rise, are displayed on a single website.
- Stanbro presented a letter of request from Mayor Caldwell to the Climate Change Commission. The letter requests the Commission to use their expertise to research the social cost of carbon on O'ahu.

Questions and Comments that followed:

1. Mehnert expressed interest in working on this paper with Chair Coffman.
2. Henry Curtis (Life of the Land) announced that the Hawaii Supreme Court ruled that the

Hawaii Gas rate case, which was previously approved by the PUC, was overturned in part due to failure to consider greenhouse gas emissions in their rate case, along with public trust and Native Hawaiian issues.

Comments and Public Testimony that Followed: There were no comments or public testimony.

Discussion and Action on Testimony Regarding Bill 2 (2020) – Relating to Off-Street Parking and Loading: Chair Coffman recused herself from this agenda item; Fletcher, as Vice Chair, presided.

- Alex Beatty from the Department of Planning and Permitting, where the bill originated provided a quick overview: Bill 2 (2020) updates the City's land use ordinance and replaces parking regulations so that regulations are simplified to reduce parking requirements where necessary, provides flexibility and prioritizes people by increasing safety and mobility. Beatty reviewed the Commission's draft testimony and noted his appreciation regarding the Commission's comments on environmental concerns.
- David Arakawa (Land Use Research Foundation) stated that the date for City Council action is September 2, 2020. He sent in a late testimony on Bill 2 to the Commission and is asking the Commission to defer action until after the affordable housing developers and other stakeholders have had the opportunity to present their case. Arakawa commented that his organization supports portions of Bill 2 (2020) but there are issues that negatively impact the cost or feasibility and economic recovery of Honolulu. There are at least four items that they would like to present at the next Commission meeting. He proposed site visits of where Bill 2 (2020) can work and where Bill 2 (2020) may not be able to work. He believes that there is other information that the Commission need to consider.
- Kathleen Rooney (Ulupono Initiative) commented that there are many positive things in Bill 2 that should be supported.
- Arakawa asked who drafted the Commission's testimony on Bill 2.
- Vice Chair Fletcher deferred discussion and action for this item to the next meeting.
- Vice Chair Fletcher turned over meeting back to Chair Coffman, who stated that the Commission's research assistant helps with the creation of initial drafts with input from commissioners, including Bill 2.

Comments and Public Testimony that Followed:

1. Chair Coffman repeated a question from the Zoom chat: "Is the social cost of carbon for a local level or for a global level? Is this metric being used to develop a potential carbon tax? If the answers can be found in the letter, could the letter be provided for review?" Stanbro responded that this is for a local level, and that the letter will be shared with the Commission.
2. Chair Coffman repeated a question from the Zoom chat: "COVID-19 has starkly exposed how much healthier the environment and people's lungs get when auto usage and industrial emissions into the atmosphere are dramatically reduced. Is anyone studying those reduced impacts here in Hawai'i? Chair Coffman stated a recent Nature Climate Change article estimates it globally; estimates of -17% for the month of April, -7% for 2020.
3. Nancy McPherson (DHHL) commented that reducing parking requirements for affordable housing projects near rail stations could increase the ability for developers to provide more affordable housing, as they can increase the number of units provided within the building envelope/height limits. Mixed use, e.g. including neighborhood commercial space within affordable multi-family developments, can also positively impact affordability. Reducing the parking requirements for neighborhood commercial in mixed use projects would be helpful.

Discussion and Action on Election of Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission (Term: July 1, 2020 to June 30, 2021)

- Chair Coffman explained the duties of the position of Chair.
- Fletcher moved and Mehnert seconded the nomination of Keener to serve as Chair for the term July 1, 2020 to June 30, 2021. (**AYE:** Alegado, Coffman, Fletcher, Keener, Mehnert; **NAY:** None; **ABSTAIN:** None.)
- Chair Coffman explains the duties of Vice-Chair. Mehnert moved and Keener seconded the nomination of Alegado to serve as Vice Chair for the term July 1, 2020 to June 30, 2021. (**AYE:** Alegado, Coffman, Fletcher, Keener, Mehnert; **NAY:** None; **ABSTAIN:** None.)

Public Input for Matters Not on the Agenda:

- Arakawa requested the Commission to consider a presentation on Bill 2 from affordable housing developers and offered an invitation to the Commission to conduct site visits along with DPP. Chair Coffman acknowledged the benefits of a site visit and due to sunshine laws, only two commissioners may attend. Alegado asked Arakawa if his group could present at the next meeting and Arakawa said that he will let parties know to be prepared to make a presentation at the next meeting. Arakawa also inquired if Bill 2 (2020) will also include the City reducing parking for City facilities, and if the bill would only affect new development. Director Stanbro responded that these policies will also apply to the City.

Tentative Next Meeting Date: The next meeting date will be scheduled at a later time.

Announcements: Keener is interested in releasing a public statement on Black Lives Matter, a short letter linking racial justice and climate justice.

Adjournment: The meeting was adjourned at 5:39 PM.