



Climate Change Commission

CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU

650 South King Street, 11th Floor • Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813

COMMISSIONERS

Charles Fletcher, Ph.D., Chair
Rosanna Alegado, Ph.D., Vice Chair
Makena Coffman, Ph.D.
Melanie Islam, AIA, NCARB, LEED APBD+C, LFA
Victoria Keener, Ph.D.

Climate Change Commission
Friday, July 29, 2022, 9:00 AM
Zoom Virtual Meeting
Meeting Minutes **DRAFT**

Members Present: Chair Charles Fletcher, Vice Chair Rosie Alegado, Makena Coffman, Melanie Islam, Victoria Keener

Members Absent: None

Public: Wendy Meguro, Cynthia Emoto, Eileen Peppard, Matthew Gonser, Elliot Parsons, Henry Curtis, Ryan Ringuette, David Smith, Felix Gottdiener, Nancy McPherson, Howard Wiig, Brad Romaine, Charley Ice, Alex Grant-Hudd, Susan Mukai, Dean Nakano, Revere Wood, Juliette Budge, Mike Plowman, Katie Rooney, Michelle Parke, Dolan Eversole, Hiro Toiya, Emily Perry, Terry Chan, Walter Billingsley, Andy Bohlander, Giannicola Tumino

1. **Call to Order:** Chair Fletcher called the meeting to order at 9:00 AM.
2. **Roll Call:** All five Commissioners were present. Quorum was established.
3. **Communications from the Public:** None
4. **Report on Activities of the Office of Climate Change, Sustainability and Resiliency**

Executive Director Matthew Gonser presented the following report:

- A. On July 27, 2022, O'ahu's last shipment of coal for the coal fired power plant arrived. This work happened with support from the Governor's powering past coal task force, the State Energy Office (HSEO), HECO, and Hawai'i Energy.
- B. Gonser expressed excitement for the potential progress of the federal Inflation Reduction Act.
- C. Ben Sullivan, CCSR's energy program manager, talked with stakeholders at the Native Hawaiian conference about partnerships for a solarized campaign and energy security on the West Side.
- D. Also on the West Side, CCSR's food security and sustainability team wrapped up three food security summits at the end of June. CCSR is looking to deploy this model further with funding from the State Department of Health.
- E. A couple of Saturdays ago, Gonser attended a virtual bike rally for the Hawai'i bicycling league to share about how important it is to invest in our communities, and that community access and mobility is an equity issue.
- F. Gonser and Alex Yee from the adaptation team were on two different KHON2 empowered segments. One focused on how climate is increasing risks of natural hazards, and the other (with Alex only) on a sea level rise discussion. All of those are available on KHON's empowered website.
- G. This past Sunday, OC 16 featured CCSR's partnership with the Mālama Learning Center.
- H. This past week, two community meetings were held regarding the Ala Wai watershed flood risk production study. There was a big showing at the virtual meeting and at the Ala Wai golf

course meeting. The Army Corps has had a better transparent and iterative process, which has led to better idea generation and community engagement.

- I. CCSR hosted the fifth Community advisory hui meeting for the aforementioned Ala Wai study on July 26, 2022, and are working on an open house likely to be held at the Blaisdell Center at the end of August.
- J. Gonser thanked the Commission for their support of Bill 22. It passed the City Council on July 6, 2022 and was signed by the Mayor on July 20, 2022; and is now Ordinance 22-17. More information related to building benchmarking can be found on CCSR's website.
- K. City bills 41 and 42 have been introduced at the City Council. Bill 41 addresses Chapter 23, which is the shoreline setback ordinance; and Bill 42 addresses Chapter 25, which is the special management area. These Bills ensure that the City's rules are up to date with the state's Act 16, and incorporated community feedback. Bill 41 passed first reading but has not yet been assigned to a committee.

Questions and comments that followed: None

Comments and public testimony that followed: None

5. Discussion and Transfer of Leadership for the Urban Heat Guidance Document

Vice Chair Alegado discussed the following:

- A. Vice Chair Alegado and Commissioner Coffman have been working on the document, but need additional time. However, Commissioner Coffman is stepping off the Commission, and recommended that the document be transferred from Commissioner Coffman to Commissioner Keener. Vice Chair Alegado will continue with the document.
- B. Commissioner Keener accepted the transfer of document ownership.

Questions and comments that followed: None

Comments and public testimony that followed: None

6. Discussion and Action on the updated Climate Change and Social Equity Guidance Document

Vice Chair Alegado discussed the following:

- A. Vice Chair Alegado and Commissioner Keener have been updating the document.
- B. They received advice from a person in a City agency to update the document to include Peoples With Disabilities (PWDs), as this was not originally one of the vulnerable communities. PWDs are the largest minority group in the US and it is important that they are included as a key demographic. The update copy broadens the language in the guidance document.

Commissioner Keener discussed the following:

- C. There are additional text and references scattered throughout the document. Table 2 has been updated to include PWDs.

Vice Chair Alegado welcomed any other changes and updates from other Commissioners. If those changes were non-substantive, Alegado wanted the document to move to a vote.

Questions and comments that followed:

1. Commissioner Islam commented that it would be great to discuss strategies other cities have done for the City to consider. Process seemed to be an important theme in the document.
 - a. Commissioner Keener commented that some of those examples from other cities can be found in the appendices of the guidance document.
2. Commissioner Coffman agreed that including PWD was very important. Coffman moved the

- document to a vote.
3. Chair Fletcher asked where in Table 2 was mental health considered.
 - a. Commissioner Keener commented that this would fall under PWD, specifically under the PWD indicator in Table 2.
 - b. Chair Fletcher asked whether that is a sufficient call out for mental health.
 - i. Commissioner Keener commented that for the purposes of the social equity guidance document, Keener would say yes, but with the note that it could be expanded to be an entire future guidance document.
 - c. Chair Fletcher asked if mental health is classified as a disability.
 - i. Commissioner Coffman commented that the Social Security Administration deems it as such.
 - d. Chair Fletcher asked if the disability title in Table 2 could be edited to include “disability and mental health”
 4. Chair Fletcher commented on 3.2, page 9, the “commission advises the office of climate change...” Fletcher asked whether this should be added to the recommendations at the beginning of the document.
 - a. Commissioner Keener commented that the sentence was covered under recommendation 5. Keener commented that recommendation 5 could call out state and city agencies.
 - b. Vice Chair Alegado commented that recommendations were kept succinct and were explained further in the body of paper.
 5. Chair Fletcher commented that on page 10, paragraph 3, the focus group expressed concern over inadequate infrastructure in case of disaster events. Fletcher wanted to make sure that was reflected in the recommendations.
 - a. Commissioner Keener recommended including this in recommendation 4, or recommendation 2.
 - i. Chair Fletcher agreed that either would work and would not constitute a substantive change, pending Courtney Sue-Ako’s opinion.
 - b. Commissioner Coffman recommended adding “including vulnerable infrastructure” at the end of the second sentence in recommendation 4.
 6. Chair Fletcher asked, on page 11, whether areas for further research were reflected in the recommendations.
 7. Commissioner Alegado commented that the guidance document is a living document, and Alegado encouraged other communities and the public to reach out with ideas. Alegado mentioned a discussion with Commissioner Keener whether to include increasing environmental justice and climate issues related to environmental damage from military operations in the document or whether it’s own document would be needed.

Comments and public testimony that followed:

1. Nancy McPherson appreciated that 3.2 called out CCSR to consult with OHA and DHHL. However, historically, DHHL has suffered from challenges of inadequate infrastructure and has had difficulty conveying this to the City for operations and maintenance—state legislation was needed. Papakōlea is a good example. McPherson recommended adding something about DHHL being more vulnerable to climate change due to historically inadequate infrastructure.
 - a. Chair Fletcher asked McPherson to wordsmith a bullet under 3.2.
 - b. Commissioner Keener wrote sample language in the chat: “DHHL have been made more vulnerable by historically inadequate infrastructure, operations, and maintenance.”
 - i. Courtney Sue-Ako commented that it should be the people or lands under DHHL that have been made more vulnerable to climate change, not DHHL itself.
 - c. McPherson wrote sample language in the chat: “Lack of modernization of infrastructure on Hawaiian Home Lands and inability to convey operations and maintenance to the City has increased vulnerability of Native Hawaiians.”
 - i. Commissioner Coffman recommended using this language. Other Commissioners agreed.
2. Henry Curtis commented that HECO opened a five-year, \$190 million climate resilience proceeding at the PUC, and has excluded the word social equity. Curtis’ group wanted inclusion of the word in the utility’s document to overhaul the grid to make it more climate secure, but so far, the utility has not done so.

A motion to adopt the update to the Climate Change and Social Equity guidance document as amended was made by Commissioner Coffman, and seconded by Commissioner Islam. The guidance was adopted. (**AYE:** Keener, Alegado, Fletcher, Islam, Coffman; **NAY:** None; **ABSTAIN:** None).

7. Discussion and Action on updated Sea Level Rise Guidance Document

Chair Fletcher presented to the following:

- A. The first version of this update was provided 2-3 months ago. Fletcher thanked Commissioner Keener for providing further edits.
- B. The document focuses on the new federal interagency task force scenarios for sea level rise, published under Sweet et. al. Fletcher described a website to get modeled scenarios for sea level rise, including scenarios for Honolulu. Fletcher described the meaning behind levels (e.g. intermediate high) of different scenarios.
- C. The document compares the interagency's scenarios to the IPCC 6's scenarios. The document contains a short analysis of temperature pathways. Fletcher described new research and how that new research makes the low and intermediate-low scenarios obsolete.
- D. The document recommends adoption of the intermediate scenario specific to the Honolulu tide gauge and the intermediate high scenario for general planning by the City and for public infrastructure works.

Questions and comments that followed:

1. Vice Chair Alegado asked whether the sea level rise viewer is being updated to account for these new projections.
 - a. Chair Fletcher commented that the Hawai'i sea level rise viewer is being updated using new modeling, which will lead to a new viewer. The current sea level rise user uses primarily one-dimensional modeling, but the new viewer will use two-dimensional modeling. The new viewer will be rolled out segment by segment over the next few years.
2. Commissioner Islam asked whether recommendation five and sentence five of the summary on page 10 were in conflict. Islam also asked whether a definition of freeboard, perhaps a graphic, should be included.
 - a. Chair Fletcher commented that the example in the recommendation is only suggestive.
 - i. Commissioner Coffman recommended adding the words "an additional" in the recommendation example.
 1. Commissioner Islam agreed.
 - b. Chair Fletcher added a link to FEMA's freeboard definition to "freeboard" in the glossary. Fletcher added a footnote to define freeboard in the summary. Fletcher agreed a freeboard visual would be beneficial, but asked whether adding such a visual would stop the document from moving forward in this meeting.
 - i. Courtney Sue-Ako commented that it probably would not allow the document to be passed in this meeting
 1. Commissioner Islam commented that, in that case, it wouldn't be necessary to add a visual.
 - ii. Chair Fletcher commented that such a visual could be constructed, voted on, and added to the document later.
3. Commissioner Coffman commented that figure 1 and figure 3-1 may not be usable in the document as they are not federal figures, and permission from the authors was not obtained.
 - a. Chair Fletcher removed those figures.
4. Commissioner Keener added a freeboard diagram from FEMA in the chat for the Commission to consider adding to the document.
 - a. Chair Fletcher recommended not including the diagram, but referencing the document in the freeboard footer on the summary, as the diagram is not localized
 - i. Commissioner Keener agreed to having a freeboard visual added later.

Comments and public testimony that followed:

1. Brad Romine asked if the Commission would continue to recommend using the 3.2 ft sea level rise exposure area from the sea level rise viewer until new data is available. Romine also asked if the Commission would continue using the 6 ft NOAA passive flooding until new data is available.

- Romine asked whether a recommendation in the paper was needed.
- a. Chair Fletcher asked Romine to develop text for the Commission to consider.
 - b. Romine wrote in the chat language to include in recommendation 2: "...and that the City continue to utilize the 3.2 ft SLR-XA until updated SLR-XA map data is available." For recommendation 3: "...and that the City continue to utilize the 6 ft passive flooding map layer from NOAA until updated map data is available."
 - i. Chair Fletcher agreed.
2. Dolan Eversole asked what the practical application of "should adopt" in the recommendations is.
- a. Chair Fletcher described what acceptance of the sea level rise guidance document would be in the context of the Mayoral Directive 18-2; specifically, future updates of the sea level rise guidance document will automatically be included in the Directive.
 - i. Gonsler further described the language in Mayoral Directive 18-2.
 - b. Fletcher described the last Commission meeting's discussion on the language "should adopt." In that meeting, Courtney Sue-Ako opined that "should adopt" is appropriate language because it is a recommendation listed under a category called recommendations.
 - c. Commissioner Coffman recommended in the chat "set as a planning and policy benchmark" instead of "adopt." Was applied to recommendations 2 and 3.
3. Nancy McPherson recommended a footnote on page 14 for the Pacifica adaptation plan.
- a. Chair Fletcher agreed.

A motion to adopt the updates to the Sea Level Rise Guidance Document as amended was made by Chair Fletcher, and seconded by Vice Chair Alegado. The updates to the Sea Level Rise Guidance Document were adopted. (**AYE:** Keener, Alegado, Fletcher, Islam, Coffman; **NAY:** None; **ABSTAIN:** None).

8. Discussion and Action on the Reducing Greenhouse Gas Emissions from Building Operation Guidance Document

Commissioner Keener presented the following:

- A. Buildings generate about 40% of global GHG emissions.
- B. President Biden plans to reduce carbon footprint of US building sector by 50% by 2035.
- C. Electricity costs in Hawai'i are high and mainly come from fossil fuels.
 - a. Reducing Energy Demand by Increasing Energy Consumption is strategy five of the Honolulu Climate Action Plan (CAP).
 - b. Hawai'i lacks quantitative targets for building energy use intensity to meet State's clean energy goals.
- D. A timeline of the document.
 - a. The first draft of the original document was introduced on 9/21/20.
 - b. The focus the document changed due to feedback from the stakeholder discussion held on 5/14/21.
- E. The purpose of the document, its relationship to local climate actions, and a summary of the document's structure.
- F. The 2021 and 2022 stakeholder discussions, including themes and resulting document modifications.
- G. The key document recommendations.
- H. Acknowledgements.

Questions and comments that followed:

1. Chair Fletcher wanted the document moved to a vote today.
2. Commissioner Alegado commented that the document showcased the hard work needed to incorporate diverse voices and supported the document.
3. Commissioner Islam commented that the document is a living document.
4. Commissioner Coffman recused herself from voting following a recommendation from Courtney Sue-Ako. One of the document's recommendations is to support the CAP, which Coffman worked closely on.

5. Chair Fletcher asked whether recommendation 3-5 should be indented under recommendation 2.
 - a. Commissioner Keener commented that the task force recommendation is independent of the other recommendations, but that it was important that it be before recommendations 3-5 to layout the need for the roadmap.
 - i. Commissioner Islam agreed.
6. Chair Fletcher asked if there was an update to Senate Bill 3381.
 - a. Commissioner Islam commented that the bill did not pass, though the need is still there. The bill would increase how quickly building codes are adopted.
 - b. Chair Fletcher recommended the language be changed to be aspirational.
 - c. Commissioner Keener recommended the language be updated to reflect that the bill did not pass, and reiterate it as a critical need.
 - d. Chair Fletcher recommended replacing sentences two and three, and referencing the bill.

Comments and public testimony that followed:

1. Matthew Gonser commented that process of creating the document created relationships that then can be used to act on the document. Gonser commented that there is a lot to navigate in terms of resourcing, and on the perceived tension between affordability and climate action.
2. Walter Billingsley recommended changing the title to “sector” instead of “operations”
 - a. Commissioner’s Keener and Islam decided to keep title as is, as embodied carbon is not discussed thoroughly.
3. Henry Curtis commented on the critical need for expedited permitting, streamlining, adding agency staff, and parallel processing, but not at the cost of reducing meaningful community input. There needs to be a distinction as expedited permitting could be used to remove community involvement and city staff.
 - a. Commissioner Keener recommended finding where expedited permitting appears in the document and inserting a clause ensuring that there are adequate opportunities for meaningful community input.
4. Howard Wiig provided the following comments:
 - a. The state legislature passed House Bill (HB) 1800, which is a comprehensive GHG reduction bill that overlaps with the Commission’s work. Wiig encouraged the Commission to look for areas of collaboration within HB 1800.
 - b. The state legislature passed HB 1801, which specifically addresses state government buildings leading by example to reduce GHG emissions.
 - c. The federal infrastructure bill has money that can be used for the reduction of GHG emissions and is an opportunity for further collaboration.
 - d. Wiig and Ben Sullivan have been working together on the City’s energy code bill and the state’s adoption of IECC 2021. They have made the codes more stringent, but Sullivan and Wiig have collaborated with the building industry and hope to get the two bills through expeditiously.
 - e. The urban heat island was specifically mentioned in the paper. Wiig works with the cool roof rating council, and the recently adopted cool wall rating council.
 - f. HSEO wants to collaborate with the Commission.
5. Nancy McPherson provided grammar edits on page 28 related to Kaupuni. McPerson commented that the Kaupuni project had to be heavily subsidized.

A motion to adopt the Reducing Greenhouse Gas Emissions from Building Operation Guidance Document as amended was made by Vice Chair Alegado, and seconded by Commissioner Islam. The Reducing Greenhouse Gas Emissions from Building Operation Guidance Document was adopted. (**AYE:** Keener, Alegado, Fletcher, Islam; **NAY:** None; **ABSTAIN:** Coffman).

9. Discussion and Action on Election of Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission (Term: July 1, 2022-June 30, 2023)

- A. Commissioner Keener nominated Vice Chair Alegado as the next Chair of the Honolulu Climate Change Commission.
 - a. Chair Fletcher supported the nomination.
 - b. Vice Chair Alegado accepted the nomination

- c. Commissioner Coffman moved to vote on Vice Chair Alegado as the next Chair of the Honolulu Climate Change Commission; Commissioner Islam seconded.
 - d. Vice Chair Alegado was elected next Chair of the Honolulu Climate Change Commission. (**AYE:** Keener, Alegado, Fletcher, Islam, Coffman; **NAY:** None; **ABSTAIN:** None).
- B. Chair Alegado nominated Commissioner Keener to be the next Vice Chair of the Honolulu Climate Change Commission.
- a. Commissioner Keener accepted the nomination.
 - b. Chair Fletcher supported the nomination.
 - c. Commissioner Islam moved to take a vote on Commissioner Keener as the next Vice Chair of the Honolulu Climate Change Commission; Commissioner Coffman seconded.
 - d. Commissioner Keener was elected next Vice Chair of the Honolulu Climate Change Commission. (**AYE:** Keener, Alegado, Fletcher, Islam, Coffman; **NAY:** None; **ABSTAIN:** None).

Questions and comments that followed: None

Comments and public testimony that followed: None

10. Acknowledgement of Commissioner Coffman's End of Service

- The Commissioner's acknowledged and thanked Commissioner Coffman for her service to the Commission.
- Commissioner Coffman thanked her fellow Commissioners and CCSR.
- Matthew Gonser expressed CCSR's thanks for Commissioner Coffman's service to the City.
- Chair Alegado thanked former Chair Fletcher for his service and leadership of the Commission, and Ryan Ringuette for his help with the Commission.

Questions and comments that followed: None

Comments and public testimony that followed: None

11. Public Input for Matters not on the Agenda: None

12. Tentative Next Meeting Date(s): The next meeting date is to be scheduled for September.

13. Announcements

- A. Matthew Gonser commented that there is a resolution moving forward through the City Council for a new appointee to the Commission. The resolution is scheduled to be heard on August 10. The nominee is Kiana Atsuka from HSEO
- B. Commissioner Islam announced that the US Green Building Council's Hawai'i Community is having it's annual conference on September 23, 2022.

14. Adjournment: Commissioner Coffman moved to adjourn the meeting; Commissioner Fletcher seconded. The meeting was adjourned at 10:45 AM.