



Climate Change Commission

CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU

650 South King Street, 11th Floor • Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813

COMMISSIONERS

Charles Fletcher, Ph.D., Chair
Rosanna Alegado, Ph.D., Vice Chair
Makena Coffman, Ph.D.
Melanie Islam, AIA, NCARB, LEED AP BD+C, LFA
Victoria Keener, Ph.D.

Climate Change Commission Friday, January 21, 2022, 9:00 AM Zoom Virtual Meeting Meeting Minutes

Members Present: Chair Charles Fletcher, Vice Chair Rosie Alegado, Melanie Islam, Victoria Keener

Members Absent: Makena Coffman

Public: Courtney Sue-Ako, Matthew Gonser, Laura Mo, Dave Martin, Julie Yunker, Walter Bilingsley, Terry Chan, Stephanie Ratte, Ryan Ringuette, Susan Mukai, Gernot Presting, Katie, Rooney

1. **Call to Order:** Chair Fletcher called the meeting to order at 9:02 AM. Recess was called for at 9:07 AM due to Commissioner Keener's technical difficulties. Recess ended at 9:08 AM when Commissioner Keener's technical difficulties were resolved.
2. **Roll Call:** Four out of five Commissioners were present. Quorum was established.
3. Approval of Meeting Minutes
 - A. Approval of the Meeting Minutes of October 28, 2021 added to agenda by unanimous vote (**AYE:** Keener, Alegado, Islam, Fletcher; **NAY:** None; **ABSTAIN:** None).
 - B. **Approval of the Meeting Minutes of October 28, 2021: The meeting minutes of October 28, 2021 were adopted.** (**AYE:** Keener, Alegado, Islam, Fletcher; **NAY:** None; **ABSTAIN:** None).
 - C. **Approval of Meeting Minutes of November 23, 2021:**
 - a. Chair Fletcher asked whether on page two, item six, bullet three: the word "currently" should be used or "in the area of 3.2 sea level rise exposure area." Those minutes are consistent with Vice Chair Alegado's notes, but requested confirmation from ACT 16. He requested changes to the following:
 - i. Page two, item six, bullet five, line two: the word "coastal" is missing an "a".
 - ii. Page two, item six, bullet five, line four: the word "title" should be "tidal" and the word "at" is missing after the word "deposits", line six: the word "national" should be "natural".
 - iii. Item seven, bullet five, sub-bullet two: the word "coastal" is missing an "a".
 - iv. Item seven, bullet six: strike the word "in" after the word "supported".
 - v. Bullet 5b, last line: add commas after "walls", "support beams".
 - vi. Bullet seven, "Corey" begins with a "K" not "C".
 - vii. Last page, bullet eight, first bullet, line three: capitalize word "indigenous".
 - viii. Last page, bullet eight, next bullet: "as much as 23%" should be "on average 23%".
 - b. **The meeting minutes of November 23, 2021 were adopted.** (**AYE:** Keener, Alegado, Islam, Fletcher; **NAY:** None; **ABSTAIN:** None).
 - D. **Approval of Meeting Minutes of December 17, 2021:**
 - a. Chair Fletcher requested that alphanumerics be used for bullet points in the future. He also requested changes to the following:
 - i. Page two, bullet six, sub-bullet two: strike first "not" from "not personally not want".
 - ii. Page two, bullet six, sub-bullet three: capitalize "indigenous".
 - iii. Top of page three: capitalize "indigenous".

- b. **The meeting minutes of December 17, 2021 were adopted.** (AYE: Keener, Alegado, Islam, Fletcher; NAY: None; ABSTAIN: None).

4. Communications and Correspondence from the Public:

- A. Chair Fletcher read a letter from Ken Kozuma, agriscience teacher from Waipahu Intermediate School. The letter described a student project to reduce their school's waste by composting. The project engages composting specialists from the Department of Education. The project was entered into Samsung's Solve for Tomorrow STEM challenge competition and they have been selected as one of the top 100 projects in the nation. They have an opportunity to submit a video for the next round.
- B. Commissioner Keener noted that the letter is specifically asking for advice on how to integrate climate change into their video.
- C. Chair Fletcher suggested that Ken Kozuma could contact Commissioners via their emails on the CCSR site, and could also add something to a future Commission agenda.
- D. Vice Chair Alegado mentioned that CCSR has resources that could help as well.
- E. Matt Gonser mentioned the CCSR, USDA food waste recovery project in Chinatown.
- F. Commissioner Keener mentioned the recent landfill siting issues could be related to Ken Kozuma's project.
- G. Chair Fletcher asked CCSR staff to make this meeting's recording available to Ken Kozuma.
- H. Matt Gonser asked if there was a due date for the video project.
- I. Chair Fletcher noted there was no due date in the letter.
- J. Commissioner Keener mentioned that the letter was sent on December 18, 2021, so the Commission may want to move quickly on it.

5. Report on the Activities of the Office of Climate Change, Sustainability and Resiliency (CCSR):

Executive Director Matthew Gonser presented the following report:

- A. Matt Gonser mentioned that CCSR's VISTA leader, Maria, has left after 1.5 years of service and explained the role of the VISTA leader and VISTA's impact on the City. He mentioned the CCSR has on boarded a new VISTA leader, Daniel, for the next 12 months, and is the 50th VISTA member. On Martin Luther King Jr. day, VISTA connected with the Pacific America Foundation and volunteered at Waikalua Loko I'a. He joined the Executive Director of the Blue Planet Foundation, Melissa Miyashiro, at the 2022 Student Energy Summit. CCSR presented at the Honolulu Youth Commission, relayed the interest of the Honolulu Climate Change Commission in connecting with the Honolulu Youth Commission. CCSR held the 1st better building benchmarking program Open House, and is holding another open house next week Wednesday at 6pm. He mentioned that the City is presenting at a career fair at the Blaisdell Center, virtually and in person, from 10 AM-4 PM. He mentioned that the City submitted an additional competitive application to the Bloomberg Harvard City Leadership Initiative for innovation and will participate in a year-long accelerator program for recruitment, hiring, development, and retention. Hawai'i

Questions and comments that followed:

- A. Commissioner Keener commented that she also wants to get the Honolulu Youth Commission onto the Honolulu Climate Change Commission's agenda.
- B. Vice Chair Alegado agreed with Commissioner Keener's comments on getting the Honolulu Youth Commission onto the agenda and also wanted to begin a rotation around the island to hear from individuals from different parts of the island. She asked Matt Gonser if CCSR has identified any bills the Commission needs to stay current on.
- C. Matt Gonser replied that CCSR hasn't gone through them yet. He commented that CCSR can share what CCSR is tracking and what CCSR has testified on at the Commission's March meeting.

Comments and public testimony that followed: None

6. Presentation by Deputy Corporation Counsel on Updates to the Sunshine Law Pursuant to Act

220 (2021)

- A. The following are highlights from Courtney Sue Ako's presentation on updates to the Sunshine Law, Act 220:
- a. Resources useful to Commissioners are located on the State of Hawai'i Office of Information Practices site.
 - b. The Commission is considered a Board.
 - c. Governor's Emergency Proclamation on December 29, 2021, suspends one requirement: not required to provide a physical location for meetings held via interactive conference technology. Effective until February 28, 2022 unless Proclamation is terminated or suspended.
 - d. Three meeting types:
 - i. In person
 - ii. Multi-site Interactive Conference Technology (ICT). Requires every physical location that a Board member is present to be open to the public. Requires the public to receive a notice per Section 92-7. The notice requires the locations where participating board members will be physically present.
 1. Loss of connection requirements. Automatic recess for up to 30 min. If audio only restored, within 15 min copies of non-confidential visual aides need to be made available to all meeting participants or those agenda items that require visual aides that can not be made available, can not be acted upon. If not able to reconnect after 30 min, and reasonable notice for reconvening is not made, then the meeting is automatically terminated.
 2. Board members with disabilities do not need to make their location available to the public and do not need to notice their location.
 - iii. Remote Meeting. Allows remote meetings via ICT
 1. ICT must allow audiovisual interaction among all members of the Board participating in the meeting
 2. Post-Feb 28, one physical location must be made available to public and have audiovisual connection.
 3. Board members do not need to make their location public, but must state who is present at their nonpublic location.
 4. Notice must include where the public can access physical location with audiovisual connection, and inform the public where to view the meeting over the internet and where the public can provide remote oral testimony.
 5. Instead of a vote roll call, a Commissioner can ask "are there any objections or abstentions?" If there are, roll call vote is necessary.
 6. Meetings should be recorded and made available to the public. Recordings must remain up until minutes are posted. A recording and written summary may be used in lieu of written minutes.
 7. Loss of connection requirements are similar to multi-site ICT requirements.
 8. Executive meetings: Board members must be audible, but not necessarily visible. Names and titles of all those present must be publicly stated and no unauthorized persons can be present. No unauthorized persons can have access to the meeting.
 - e. Key differences between multi-site and remote meetings:
 - i. Multi-site meetings require multiple, publicly accessible physical locations. Remote meetings require only one, publicly accessible physical location.
 - ii. Notice requirements differ based on locations available to the public

Questions and comments that followed:

- A. Matt Gonser noted that the presentation parallels the Commission's interest in having meetings in multiple locations.
- B. Chair Fletcher asked Courtney Sue-Ako if she wanted the Commission to take any actions.
- a. Courtney Sue-Ako replied that they could move to the next agenda item if the Commission is ready to discuss it.

Comments and public testimony that followed: None

7. Discussion & Action on Format for Holding Meetings Pursuant to Act 220 (2021)

- A. Commissioner Keener noted the option of using the video recording and brief summary instead of meeting minutes might be worth discussing. She noted she finds the meeting minutes helpful, but was open to a discussion.
- B. Vice Chair Alegado noted she finds the meeting minutes helpful. She also noted that with the current situation she envisioned the Commission continuing to use the remote function.
- C. Chair Fletcher noted he finds the meeting minutes helpful.
- D. Commissioner Islam noted she finds the meeting minutes helpful.
- E. Courtney Sue-Ako mentioned that multi-site meetings might be a good option for the Commission to consider in regards to the Commission's desire to hold meetings elsewhere on the island.
- F. Chair Fletcher noted the need to work out logistics as the Commission plans for a new style of meeting.
- G. Matt Gonser noted that whenever the Commission moves to have more place-based meetings, the intended dates will need to be noticed well in advance. He expressed the current six days notice may not be enough to generate participation.
- H. Chair Fletcher mentioned if Commissioners are on neighborhood board agendas before a Commission meeting, the Commission could generate interest that way.
- I. Commissioner Keener asked whether multi-site can have only one public location with a Commissioner, and the rest of the Commissioner's locations be not open to the public.
 - a. Courtney Sue-Ako replied that what Commissioner Keener described is the remote option.
- J. Chair Fletcher noted the flexibility of this option, and that a subset of the Commission could travel to a community while the rest of the Commission remained remote.
- K. Commissioner Islam commented that this option would be especially useful if there was a theme to those meetings.
- L. Chair Fletcher commented that one important theme would be listening. He noted that the community will probably want to prepare, so the Commission will need to give the community advance notice.
- M. Matt Gonser asked Courtney Sue-Ako whether a Commissioner needs to be present at a multi-site meeting location.
 - a. Courtney Sue-Ako replied that sites where Commissioners are present need to be available to the public, and that other sites can be made available to the public without the presence of a Commissioner.
- N. Commissioner Keener asked whether the new Act will require in person meetings to have web streaming.
 - a. Courtney Sue-Ako replied she will need to review and get back to the Commission.
 - b. Matt Gonser noted that CCSR would endeavor to support web streaming in-person meetings.

Comments and public testimony that followed: None

8. Discussion & Action to Adopt Testimony for Submission to the Honolulu City Council on Bill 48 (2021) Relating to Underground Storage Tanks

- A. Chair Fletcher asked Vice Chair Alegado to introduce the document.
- B. Vice Chair Alegado drafted testimony in support of Bill 48. She described Bill 48, and the Commission's role in testifying: to establish the connection of this Bill to the Cities long term climate change plans, including the Board of Water Supply's (BWS) master plan, among others. She noted Bill 48 as one part of O'ahu's climate defense. She mentioned that she volunteered to draft testimony for the Commission at the Commission's last meeting. She described the first paragraph as summarizing the topics in the Bill, and connecting this plan to other City policies. She also identified portions of other policies and, State's Commission on Water Resources' stance on Red Hill. She asked whether the Commission wanted to reference all of the reports she had included.
 - a. Chair Fletcher was in favor of referencing reports, and noted that the other Commissioners were on board.

- C. Vice Chair Alegado asked CCSR if there were any related policies that she might have missed.
 - a. Matt Gonser replied that CCSR currently did not, but that CCSR looked forward to working with the Commission to move this forward.
- D. Chair Fletcher noted that the Commission would open the letter up to public comment later.
- E. Vice Chair Alegado described paragraph 2 as tying the role of the aquifer to meeting the demand for freshwater.
- F. Commissioner Keener recommended using the 2018 National Climate Assessment Chapter.
- G. Vice Chair Alegado mentioned asking CCSR or Graduate Assistant to help with cleaning up comments at the end.
- H. Commissioner Keener recommended adding the document's drought comment would be valuable and drafted a sentence for it.
- I. Chair Fletcher made a number of grammatical edits and added references throughout the testimony that Vice Chair Alegado agreed to.
- J. Vice Chair Alegado described in paragraph 3 the threat of increased power loss due to the increased frequency of natural disasters from climate change to the BWS water supply systems. She mentioned that the Navy's current plans to treat water require power. She mentioned the important role of the gravity flow facilities, including the Hālawā shaft which is closed due to Red Hill, in the emergency disaster plans in the BWS 2016 Water Supply Master Plan. She asked the Commission whether they should quote Ernie Lau's testimony. She then described the role of Bill 48 in O'ahu's critical climate defense.
- K. Chair Fletcher recommended a citation change from "UH CICAP 2010" to "IPCC, 2021". He recommended that the testimony did not need to quote Ernie Lau, as it would be difficult to find, but recommended that the sentence be attributed to Executive Manager Ernie Lau.
- L. Vice Chair Alegado described in the last paragraph the need for Bill 48 and the City's involvement in matters such as Red Hill by referencing the outcome of the 2014 jet fuel leak. She also noted that SB1259 a few years ago would have closed the loophole of underground storage tanks, but was ultimately tabled.
- M. Chair Fletcher proposed a summary paragraph.
- N. Vice Chair Alegado recommended that "navy" be "US Navy".
- O. A chat from Walter Billingsley clarified Ernie Lau's title, which Chair Fletcher amended in the testimony.
- P. Vice Chair Alegado recommended to footnote the Water Commission's stance on Red Hill in the first paragraph.
- Q. Vice Chair Alegado moved to adopt testimony in principle per CCSR formatting changes.
 - a. Commissioner Keener seconded Vice Chair Alegado's move to adopt the testimony in principle.
- R. Chair Fletcher asked if there were any comments from the public.
 - a. Commissioner Keener replied that there didn't appear to be any comments from the public.
- S. Chair Fletcher asked Courtney Sue-Ako whether testimony needed to be read into record or could just be voted on.
 - a. Courtney Sue-Ako replied that the Commission could vote to adopt.
- T. Chair Fletcher asked for a vote to adopt testimony relating to underground storage tanks.
- U. **Testimony was adopted (AYE: Keener, Alegado, Islam, Fletcher; NAY: None; ABSTAIN: None).**
- V. Matt Gonser requested that the testimony be sent to Corrane for CCSR formatting. CCSR will confirm once testimony is submitted.

Questions and comments that followed: None

Comments and public testimony that followed: None

9. Public Input for Matters Not on the Agenda: None

10. Tentative Next Meeting Date: The next meeting date is scheduled for March 4, 2022 at 9 AM via Zoom.

11. Announcements:

- A. Commissioner Keener announced that the Hawai'i United States Affiliated Pacific Islands Chapter was hosting a public engagement workshop on January 24, 2022 from 12-430 PM, and described the workshop and how to attend.
- B. Dave Martin commented that the Honolulu Fire Department requires a permit for storage tanks of flammable materials.

12. Adjournment: The meeting was adjourned at 10:55 AM.